



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

United States Patent and Trademark Office

Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/586,554	07/19/2006	Edward Marion Casaccia	PU040012	6226
24498	7590	11/19/2010		
Robert D. Shedd, Patent Operations				
THOMSON Licensing LLC				
P.O. Box 5312				
Princeton, NJ 08543-5312				
EXAMINER				
HARVEY, DAVID E				
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
2481				
MAIL DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
11/19/2010		PAPER		

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

1. **With respect to the arguments filed 11/9/2010:**

A) The examiner does not necessarily disagree with the "differences" argued by applicant when considered with respect to the instant invention **as disclosed in the instant specification**. However, the examiner maintains that the instant invention, **as set forth in the instant claims**, does not positively set forth the instant invention with a scope commensurate with such argued differences. Specifically, the examiner continues to maintain that the claims, as currently drafted, are far broader than the scope of these arguments [e.g., for reasons previously addressed in the Office action mailed 8/27/2010].

B) The following is noted:

1) As currently drafted, claim 1 reads:

1. A method of controlling at least one production device for producing a show, comprising the steps of:

establishing a plurality of states of the at least one production device, each state corresponding to at least one operation executable by the device;

storing the states of the at least one production device as corresponding memory objects which upon execution cause the one production device to execute the at least one operation, which results in generation of a scene;

responsive to selection of each memory object, physically actuating at least one actuator of the at least one production device to control an operation of the at least one production device in accordance with the at least one operation associated with that state memory object so the actuator manifests a status of the production device.

2) Construing the "at least one" terminology of claim 1 to be "one", claim 1 reads as follows:

1. A method of controlling a production device for producing a show, comprising the steps of:

establishing a plurality of states of the production device, each state corresponding to an operation executable by the device;

storing the states of the production device as corresponding memory objects which upon execution cause the production device to execute the operation, which results in generation of a scene;

responsive to selection of each memory object, physically actuating an actuator of the production device to control an operation of the production device in accordance with the operation associated with that state memory object so the actuator manifests a status of the production device.

3) Given that which is set forth in part 2 of the instant paragraph, the examiner maintains that claim 1 reads on a **video production device** that includes:

A) A touch screen type control panel that displays a GUI comprised of programmable physically actuated soft keys wherein, for example:

1. Programming data is stored in a memory for each soft key (i.e., **"memory objects"**) such that, when **executed** by the production device, each of the stored memory objects cause the production device to take on (e.g., manifest) a respective production **"state"**; i.e., wherein each production **"state"** is **"established"**/defined via the creation of the programming data (and/or, e.g., alternatively, is established via the selectable physical **"states"**/configurations of the production device itself);

2. The user **"selects"** a given memory object via the **physical actuation** of the respective selected soft key (e.g., control panel **actuators**) causing the system, via the **physical actuation** of system **actuators** (i.e., switches and relays), to control the **operation** of the production device in accordance with the state established/defined by the selected memory object, wherein:

a) The control panel **actuators** comprise display indicators that **"manifests"** (i.e., reveal/show/evidence/indicate) a respective operating **"status"** of the device and, likewise (alternatively), the physical state of each system **actuator** **"manifests"** (i.e., reveals/shows/evidences/indicates) a respective operating **"status"** of the device; and

b) Each of the operation(s) executed by the production device results in the generation/output of a respective video signal which, by definition, is representative a **"scene"**.

4) The examiner maintains the applied "prior art" evidences the fact that video production devices, of the type set forth in part 3 of the instant paragraph, were at least "obvious" to those one or ordinary skill in the art at the time of the instant invention (for reasons addressed previously); e.g., -

1. A method of controlling a production device for producing a show, comprising the steps of:

establishing a plurality of states of the production device, each state corresponding to an operation executable by the device;

{With respect to the applied prior art, the examiner maintains that this recitation broadly/fairly reads on the user's ability to program a given "programmable soft key" of an A/V production "device" with a user specified video production events/ "states" which, when performed/executed by the production device, causes specific A/V production "operation(s)" to be performed/"executed" by the device, wherein-

the user defines, i.e., thereby "establishing", the reproduction "states"/"operations" that are to be "executed" by the device, whenever a given "soft key" is selected/actuated by the user}

storing the states of the production device as corresponding memory objects which upon execution cause the production device to execute the operation, which results in generation of a scene;

{With respect to the applied prior art, the examiner maintains that this recitation broadly reads on the storing of the programming data for the given each soft key, wherein-

The data stored for each key represents a stored "memory object" defining a given "state"/"operation" of device such that, when "executed" by the device, results in the generation of a corresponding A/V signal (i.e., representative of a "scene")}

responsive to selection of each memory object, physically actuating an actuator of the production device to control an operation of the production device in accordance with the operation associated with that state memory object so the actuator manifests a status of the production device.

{ With respect to the applied prior art, the examiner maintains that this recitation broadly reads on the execution of a production sequence by the device wherein each stored memory object (i.e., event) is selected by the device in a step-by-step fashion via (and or resulting in) the "physical actuation of actuators" of the device, e.g. soft-keys, mechanical switches & relays, to control the device and to manifest a respective reproduction "state"/"status" of the device}

2. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to DAVID E. HARVEY whose telephone number is (571) 272-7345. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F from 6:00AM to 3PM.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Mr. Peter-Anthony Pappas, can be reached on (571) 272-7646. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

/DAVID E HARVEY/
Primary Examiner, Art Unit 2481

DAVID E HARVEY
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 2481